

**Documenting Dispossession and Exile:
The Relevance of International Norms on Registration and Data
Management with Regard to a Negotiated Solution to the Palestinian
Refugee Problem**

NERYS IRVING-JONES

**Submitted to the University of Exeter
As a thesis for the degree of
Doctor of Philosophy in Politics**

July 2008

This thesis is available for Library use on the understanding that it is copyright material and that no quotation from the thesis may be published without proper acknowledgement.

I certify that all material in this thesis which is not my own work has been identified, and that no material has previously been submitted and approved for the award of a degree by this or any other University.

Signed:.....

Abstract

This study examines the use of international practice, by exploring the notion that international standards and precedents that have been applied to refugee situations in other cases can give guidance to Palestinian refugee registration data, in reaching future claims for compensation. Three broad questions are put forward in this study:

1. To what extent can international practice as adopted by the United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees (UNHCR) in its registration and management practices offer a constructive perspective on Palestinian refugee registration procedures and data?
2. What is the relevance of the experience gained in the settlement of refugee claims in international settings, such as the practice of international Claim Commissions in search of guidelines for the planning of a future Palestinian Claim Commission?
3. Can existing Palestinian refugee registration data be constructed in a suitable way for the preparation of future claims?

On a broader level, the study will seek to explore two questions. Firstly, can Palestinian refugee registration data point towards findings that could contribute, by making available to negotiators, the quantitative data necessary for determining claims? Secondly, can international guidelines provide a framework for the use of Palestinian registration data in confronting refugee claims and losses?

The study also takes on a technical analysis. The case studies subject to the analysis are Bosnia and Herzegovina (BiH) and Kosovo. Via this approach, the research will study the general norms and procedures adopted by two Claims Commissions to resolve refugee claims. Insights are then made into the possible transfer of such procedures to the Palestinian refugee case. In doing so, a clearer picture of how a future Palestinian Claims Commission could be established, and how existing Palestinian refugee registration data could be assembled, is then examined.

This thesis argues that one of the major gaps in research on Palestinian refugees is that it has not benefited from the experience of international lesson-learning through the analysis of other refugee cases and especially the utilization of the experience of UNHCR and precedents set by international Claim Commissions. The study's main conclusion is that international guidelines and precedents have significant benefits for preparing Palestinian refugee registration data, in reaching future claims for compensation within the Arab-Israeli negotiations.

Acknowledgments

This study is the product of more than three years of research. Compiling, organizing and carving a readable study out of my notes was an enormous task and one made possible only through the contribution of several people to the development of this thesis. To all of them goes my sincere gratitude and thanks for helping me during the days when I thought that I could not finish this thesis and during the times when I was determined to do so. My initial thanks go to Professor Michael Dumper for his input and advice.

Thanks must go to Professor Michael Fischbach who devoted much of his precious time above and beyond the call of duty to answer my questions and to enlighten a lot of the complexities of Palestinian refugee archive research for me. Also Professor Salim Tamari deserves my gratitude for his assistance whenever I contacted him. I would also like to thank Dr Roby Nathanson who helped me understand the complexities of the Custodian of Absentees' Property database.

I would further like to thank the UNRWA staff and in particular Anne Nixon and Ardi Imseis for assisting me in the initial stages of this research. I would also like to thank Dr Rosie Wyles for being such an inspiration at a

time when I needed it most and Dr Ghada Ageel and Robert Arnold for some last minute advice and assistance which was deeply appreciated. Special thanks also go to my friends: Asi, Samuel, Nich, Nufar, Eirlys and especially Alex for their support and friendship during times of intellectual solitude.

Hats off to Paul Auchterloni, Collections Manager and Librarian for Middle East Studies at the University of Exeter, whom, I have known since the time of my Bachelor degree for so generously assisting me with all my research questions. I am also very grateful to Claire Stewart from the University of Exeter Access to Learning Centre, the Council for British Research in the Levant and the University of Exeter Access Fund for the financial support they granted me.

The greatest vote of appreciation I owe to my father and to my sister whose assistance and support turned this ambition into reality. Thanks must also go to Peter, Anne and John whose enormous help and encouragement over the years and beautiful environment for the write up of this study made it such an enjoyable experience. Also Marley Doogle, who sat so patiently with me throughout most of the writing of this study, and was more help than a dog can know!

Finally, this work is dedicated to the memory of my mother my world-wide travelling companion, for her great courage, dignity and spirit of adventure. Diolch o galon i ti mami am bopeth gnes di amdanaf.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Abstract	2	
Acknowledgements	4	
Table of Contents	6	
Illustrations	9	
Abbreviations	10	
Chapter One		14
1.1. Presentation of the Research	15	
<i>1.1.1. Definition of the subject:</i>	15	
<i>Overall argument and hypothesis</i>		

1.1.2. Research methodology	23	
1.2. Review of the Literature and Sources		29
1.2.1. International Conferences and literature dealing with Palestinian refugee research		29
1.2.2. Palestinian NGO's and International Centres for Refugee Research		35
1.2.3. Sources of Palestinian refugee statistics	36	
1.3. A Final Note		37

Chapter Two - The International Refugee Regime and the Palestinian Refugee Issue 39

2.1. Introduction	40	
2.1.1. Origins of the international refugee regime		41
2.1.2. The United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees		45
2.2. The Palestinian Refugees	51	
2.2.1. Who are the Palestinians?	51	
2.2.2. Registered Palestine refugees - Demographic data		59
2.2.3. Palestinian refugee living conditions		63
2.2.4. The distribution of Palestinian refugees	65	
2.3 United Nations Involvement in Palestine		68
2.3.1. UNRWA: An overview	69	
2.3.2. UNCCP: An overview	74	
2.3.3. The differences between UNRWA and UNHCR mandates		78
3.1. Conclusion	85	

Chapter Three - Refugee Reparations and International Practice 87

3.1. Introduction	88	
3.2. Refugee Reparations	88	
3.2.1. Issues of reparations		88
3.2.2. Restitution	90	
3.2.3. Compensation		93
3.2.4. Property restitution and legal instruments		96
3.3. Looking at International Practice		99
3.3.1. Historical overview of UNHCR's data collection methods		99
3.3.2. Gathering refugee data	101	
3.3.3. Alternatives to registration		106
3.3.4. The operational parameters of refugee registration		112
3.3.5. UNHCR Handbooks for Refugee Registration	114	
3.4. New Advances in the Registration Process		119
3.4.1. Project Profile		119
3.4.2. The case of Kosovo		122

3.5. UNRWA's Refugee Registration Instructions **124**

3.5.1. *UNRWA's consolidated eligibility and registration instructions* 124

3.5.2. *To what extent can international practice as adopted by UNHCR in its registration and management practices offer a constructive perspective on Palestinian refugee registration procedures and data?* 129

3.6. Conclusion 133

Chapter Four - International Claim Processes: A Technical Analysis **134**

4.1. Introduction 135

4.2. International Property Restitution 135

4.2.1. *Why this method?* 136

4.2.2. *Literature review* 138

4.2.3. *Property compensation/restitution programmes*
141

4.3. The Case of Bosnia and Kosovo 146

4.3.1. *Establishing the claim process* 147

4.3.2. *Standards of proof* 152

4.3.3. *The legal nature of the claim process*
156

4.4. Looking Towards a Palestinian Claim Commission **161**

4.4.1. *Palestinian Claim Commission: A Framework* 161

4.4.2. *What type of claim?* 161

4.4.3. *Structure of the Commission* 164

4.4.4. *Procedural rules* 169

4.4.5. *Identifying and assessing Palestinian refugee property claims* 171

4.5. Conclusion 176

Chapter Five - Palestinian Refugee Registration Sources 178

5.1. Introduction 179

5.2. Overview to the Palestinian Refugee Property Issue **179**

5.2.1. *Political negotiations and recent developments on the refugee issue*
179

5.3. The Main Sources of Palestinian Refugee Registration Data 188

5.3.1. *The ICRC data* 189

5.3.2. *The AFSC data* 191

5.3.3. *The UNRWA data* 192

5.3.4. *The UNCCP data* 194

5.3.5.	<i>The Custodian of Absentees' Property data</i>	
	196	
5.3.6.	<i>The Jordanian data</i>	199
5.4. Data Limitations		201
5.4.1.	<i>Access to the data</i>	201
5.4.2.	<i>The condition and usability of the data</i>	204
5.4.3.	<i>Summary of the problems and gaps identified in the data</i>	
	206	
5.4.4.	<i>Various estimates of Palestinian refugee property data</i>	
	212	
5.5. Suggestions for a Future Framework for Palestinian Refugee		
	216	
Registration Data		
5.5.1. The Databases		217
5.5.2. The UNRWA data		221
5.5.3. The UNCCP data		222
5.5.4. Other data sources		225
5.6. Conclusion		227
Chapter Six - Conclusion		228
6.1. Summary		238
Appendices		255
Bibliography		

Illustrations

Figures

1.1.2. UNRWA Palestinian Registered Refugee Registration Card	24
3.3.4. Three Cornerstones of the Unified Approach	117

Tables

2.2.2. UNRWA Registered Refugee with UNRWA	61
2.2.2. MOP Population Estimated Number of Palestinians in the World	62

Abbreviations

AFSC	American Friends Service Committee
AHC	Arab Higher Committee
AVR	Assisted Voluntary Return
BADIL	Resource Centre for Palestinian Residency and Refugee Rights in Palestine
BiH	Bosnia and Herzegovina
CBS	Central Bureau of Statistics
CDR	Central Data Repository
CERI	Consolidated Eligibility and Registration Instructions
CERMOC	Centre d'Etudes et de Recherches sur le Moyen-Orient Contemporain
CIDA	Canadian International Development Agency
CIVITAS	Foundations for Participation: Civic Structures for the Palestinian Refugee Camps and Exile Communities
COHRE	Centre on Housing Rights and Evictions
CPRR	Council for Palestinian Restitution and Repatriation
CRPC	Commission for Real Property Claims
CRRPD	Commission for Resolution of Real Property Disputes
DHA	Department of Humanitarian Affairs
DoP	Declaration of Principles
DP	displaced persons
DPA	Dayton Peace Agreement
ECHA	Convener of the Executive Committee for Humanitarian Affairs
ECHO	European Commission's department for Humanitarian Aid
ECHR	European Court of Human Rights
ECOSOC	Economic and Social Council
EECC	Eritrea-Ethiopia Claims Commission
ERC	Humanitarian Affairs and the Emergency Relief Coordinator

ESM	Economic Survey Mission
EU	European Union
ExCom	Executive Committee of the United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees
FAFO	Norwegian Institute for Applied Social Science
FERO	Field Eligibility and Registration Officer
FRY	Former Republic of Yugoslavia
GAPAR	Syrian General Authority for Palestine Arab Refugees
GFLP	German Forced Labour Compensation Programme
GIS	geographic information system
GPS	global satellite positioning
HCR	League of Nations High Commissioner for Refugees
HPCC	Housing Property Claims Commission
HPD	Housing and Property Directorate
HVAP	Holocaust Victim Assets Programme
IASC	Coordinator Chairs the Interagency Standing Committee
ICC	International Criminal Court
ICEM	Intergovernmental Committee for European Migration
ICHEIC	International Commission on Holocaust Era Insurance Claims
ICJ	International Court of Justice
ICM	Intergovernmental Committee for Migration
ICRC	International Committee of the Red Cross
ICTR	International Criminal Tribunal for Rwanda
ICTY	International Criminal Tribunal for the Former Yugoslavia
ID	identity documentation
IDD	Inter-Agency Internal Displacement Division
IDF	Israeli Defence Force
IDP's	internally displaced persons
IDRC	International Development Research Centre
IHL	International Humanitarian Law
ILA	Israel Lands Administration

IOM	International Organization for Migration
IPS	Institute of Palestine Studies
IPS	Integrated Property System
IRO	International Refugee Organization
IT	information technology
JCC	Jewish Claims Conference
JMCC	Jerusalem Media and Communication Centre
JNF	Jewish National Fund
KLA	Kosovo Liberation Army
KVM	Kosovo Verification Mission
LAS	League of Arab States
LAWE	Palestinian Society for the Protection of Human Rights and the Environment
LSCR	League of Red Crescent Societies
MDSD	Most Different Systems Design
MiMOSA	Migrant Management & Operational Systems Application
MMP	Microfinance and Micro-enterprise Programme
MOP	Palestinian Authority's Ministry of Planning
MSSD	Most Similar Systems Design
NATO	North Atlantic Treaty Organization
NGO	non-governmental organization
NSU	Negotiations Support Unit
OAU	Organization of African Unity
OCHA	Office for Humanitarian Affairs
OPTs	Occupied Palestinian Territories
OSCE	Organization for Security and Co-operation in Europe
OSO	Operational Support Officers
PA	Palestinian Authority (sometimes PNA: Palestinian National Authority)
PCA	Permanent Court of Arbitration

PCBS	Palestinian Central Bureau of Statistics
PHC	Population, Housing and Establishment Census
PICMME	Provisional Intergovernmental Committee for the Movements of Migrants from Europe
PLO	Palestine Liberation Organization
PLS	Palestine Land Society
PP	Project Profile
PPR	permanent place of residence
PRRN	Palestinian Refugee Research Net
PRRP	Palestine Refugee Records Project
RAO	Refugee Affairs Officer
RG	Registration Guide
RO	Refugee Office
RRs	Registered Refugees
RRIS	Refugee Registration Information System
RTD	Repossessions Tracking Database
RWG	Refugee Working Group
SHAML	Palestinian Refugees and Diaspora Centre
SHC	Special Hardship Case
SSE	Small-Scale Enterprise
TO	Technical Office
TRC	Truth and Reconciliation Commission
UN	United Nations
UNAMA	United Nations Assistance Mission in Afghanistan
UNCC	United Nations Claims Commission
UNCCP	United Nations Conciliation Commission for Palestine
UNDP	United Nations Development Programme
UNDRP	United Nations Disaster Relief Project
UNHCR	United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees
UNMIK	United Nations Mission in Kosovo
UNPPR	United Nations Relief for Palestine Refugees

UNPROFOR	United Nations Protection Force
UNRRA	United Nations Relief and Reconstruction Agency
UNRWA	United Nations Relief and Works Agency for Palestine Refugees in the Near East
UNSC	United Nations Security Council
URS	Unified Registry System
USCR	United States Committee for Refugees
WB	World Bank
WFP	World Food Programme
WJRO	World Jewish Restitution Organization
WOJAC	World Organization of Jews from Arab Countries